

Tanzania: Community Services of the Churches – Sector-related Programme Education I

Ex-post evaluation

OECD sector	11320 / Secondary Education	
BMZ project number	1993 65 750	
Project-executing agency	Christian Social Services Commission (CSSC)	
Consultant	-	
Year of evaluation	2002	
	Project appraisal (planned)	Ex-post evaluation (actual)
Start of implementation	Q 2 1994	Q 2 1994
Period of implementation	24 months	36 months
Investment costs	EUR 1.23 million	EUR 1.23 million
Counterpart contribution	0	0
FC amount	EUR 1.23 million	EUR 1.23 million
Other institutions/donors involved	GTZ, German churches (EZE, Misereor/KZE)	GTZ, German churches (EED, Misereor/KZE)
Performance rating	2	
• Significance / relevance	1	
• Effectiveness	3	
• Efficiency	2	

Brief Description, Overall Objective and Programme Purposes with Indicators

The overall objective of the sector-related programme Education I was the quantitative and qualitative improvement of the education at secondary schools in Tanzania. The agreed programme purposes were the improvement of science teaching at secondary schools run under the responsibility of the church as well as the intensification of and confidence building in the cooperation between the churches and the state in the field of education (secondary school 1, grades 8 to 11).

The project is part of a multilateral cooperation between the German and Tanzanian governments as well as the German and Tanzanian churches which aims at supporting community services by the churches in the areas of health and education. In the context of the sector-related programme Education I mainly church-run secondary schools were procured with mostly scientific teaching and school books and laboratories were rehabilitated and equipped. Under a training measure in the context of Technical Cooperation (TC) primarily scientific teachers were advised on technical and organisational questions. The German churches are providing funds through their development cooperation institutions EED and KZE, thus covering most of the costs incurred by the ecumenical programme-executing agency, the Christian Social Services Commission (CSSC).

The total cost of the FC project – not including any financial contributions from GTZ or the German churches – amounts to EUR 1.23 million.

Major Deviations from the original Programme Planning and their main Causes

The individual activities financed by FC under the nation-wide education programme are:

- supply, distribution and storage of manuals (reference libraries) for teachers at 415 secondary schools,
- supply of schoolbooks for 120 church-run secondary schools and
- rehabilitation and equipment of laboratories at 60 church-run secondary schools.

These measures, just as the above-mentioned TC and church measures, were implemented according to schedule. The programme-executing agency CSSC was responsible for the coordination and supervision of activities of the different dioceses.

As the preparation at the individual secondary schools, especially for the rehabilitation and equipment of the science laboratory, was more difficult than had been expected the implementation of the programme was delayed by roughly one year.

Key Results of the Impact Analysis and Performance Rating

The pedagogic advantage of the new teaching method is first of all that the school books promote the independent learning of the pupils so that they are able afterwards to read, discuss and understand what has been told during the lessons. With the experiment the previously merely cognitive teaching is supported by practical illustrations and experience has shown that this encourages especially the interest of girls. The new teaching method will promote communication also between the pupils and enables pupils' perception to become the focus of teaching. Moreover, after a few years the following sectoral impacts of the programme have become apparent:

- The model developed by the churches for scientific teaching (including laboratories) has had a broad effect and has become established not only at the church-run secondary schools but also at many state-run and other private schools. (Currently the share of state secondary schools is approx. 57%, church schools and other private schools each account for a good 21 %). In July 2002 the third phase of the programme was evaluated positively.
- By and large advanced teacher training in the field of natural sciences at private and state schools could be standardized.
- As a result of the initiative practical examinations were again introduced for pupils leaving the secondary school 1.

As regards sector policy objectives, however, the success was rather moderate: As the reform of the secondary school policy has made little progress so far the coordination at the district level is poor. As a result, in the last few years about 10% of mostly rural church schools had to be handed back to the state - given the comparatively high fees and low demand costs could

no longer be covered. This and the occasional poaching of teachers are the most important risks to the sustainability of a qualitatively and quantitatively adequate science teaching at church schools.

The project supports girls and boys. Overall, the 56 % share of girls at the 60 church schools with laboratories is clearly higher than the 47 % share of girls at state schools. The churches are striving to grant access to its schools especially to girls from poorer families (among other things with grants financed by the World Bank). Overall, however, the much higher fees charged by the private schools clearly restrict the access of children from poorer families. The project measures do not lead to any increased environmental burden since the chemicals are generally handled properly.

The developmental effectiveness of the project is assessed as follows:

- The programme aimed at improving examination results in the natural sciences at the transition to level 2 of the secondary schools and at improving the availability of trained teachers. The results achieved for both aims are satisfactory. From our point of view, the above-mentioned problems in the operation of church schools (financial sustainability, teacher availability) might adversely affect the sustainability of at least a part of rural secondary schools. In this respect coordination by the state authorities was not adequate though CSSC has been trying to built up decentral structures and, thus, to establish the required mechanisms for coordination with the state. In general we assign the programme an adequate degree of developmental effectiveness (rating 3).
- For reasons of methodology we do not assess the efficiency of school projects with the help of rates of return. For this reason we would simply like to state that the overall costs incurred by the project were adequate (satisfactory degree of efficiency: rating 2).
- As a result of the improved science teaching at church schools the quality of teaching was clearly improved. Moreover, the basis for a longer-term cooperation between the state and the churches was laid in phase 1. Due to the fact that the teaching model was largely adopted at the state and other private schools we assign the project a high significance. In view of the importance of a qualitatively demanding science teaching in a country in which overall participation at secondary schools is low, our rating of the project's significance and relevance is good (rating 1).

Under consideration of the above-mentioned partial criteria the overall developmental effectiveness of the sector related programme Education I is rated as satisfactory (rating 2).

General Conclusions applicable to all Projects

The project is an example that shows how it is possible to achieve major quantitative and qualitative results in the education sector especially thanks to the good cooperation between different instruments employed in development cooperation (including the intensive coordination between FC and TC with joint progress reports).

Legend

Developmentally successful: Ratings 1 to 3
--

Rating 1	Very high or high degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 2	Satisfactory degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 3	Overall adequate degree of developmental effectiveness

Developmental failures: Ratings 4 to 6

Rating 4	Overall inadequate degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 5	Clearly insufficient degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 6	The project is a total failure

Criteria for the Evaluation of Project Success

The evaluation of a project's "developmental effectiveness" and its assignment during the final evaluation to one of the various success levels described below in more detail focus on the following fundamental questions:

- Are the **project objectives** reached to a sufficient degree (aspect of project **effectiveness**)?
- Does the project generate sufficient significant **developmental effects** (project **relevance and significance** measured by the achievement of the overall development-policy objective defined beforehand and its effects in political, institutional, socio-economic and socio-cultural as well as ecological terms)?
- Were and are the objectives reached with **a reasonable amount of funds/resources** and how can the project's microeconomic and macroeconomic impact be measured (aspect of **efficiency** of the project concept)?
- To the extent that undesired **(side) effects** occur, are these tolerable?

We do not treat **sustainability**, which is a key aspect of project evaluation, as a separate category (as the world bank does) but instead consider it as a cross-cutting element that concerns all four fundamental questions of project success. A project is sustainable if the project-executing agency and/or the target group are able to continue to use the project facilities created over an economically reasonable period of time or to successfully continue the project activities on their own once the financial, organizational and/or technical support has come to an end.