

Rwanda: Repair of the Road Kayonza-Rusumo

Ex-post evaluation

OECD sector	21020 / Road traffic	
BMZ project number	1987 65 893	
Project-executing agency	Ministère des Travaux Publics et de l'Energie (now: Ministère des Travaux Publics, Transports et Communications)	
Consultant	Dr. Ing. Walter International (DIWI), Essen, Germany	
Year of evaluation	2002	
	Project appraisal	Ex-post evaluation
Start of implementation	Q 1 1989	Q 2 1991
Period of implementation	18 months	30 months
Investment costs	DEM 15.1 million	DEM 15.0 million
Counterpart contribution	DEM 0.9 million	DEM 0.9 million
Financing, of which FC funds	DEM 11.0 million	DEM 14.1 million
Other institutions/donors involved	None	None
Performance rating	Overall sufficient degree of developmental effectiveness	
• Significance / relevance	2	
• Effectiveness	3	
• Efficiency	2	

Brief Description, Overall Objective and Project Purposes with Indicators

The project comprised the periodic maintenance (repair and resealing) of the road from Kayonza to Rusumo for a distance of approx. 91 km including the turnoff to Kibungo (approx. 3.6 km) and the repainting of the bridge over the bordering river Akagera near Rusumo (border to Tanzania). The overall objective of the project was to ensure and promote Rwanda's foreign trade and to develop the southeastern region of the country via cost-efficient transports. The project purpose was to reduce the vehicle operating costs for travel on the road from Kayonza-Rusumo.

Achievement of the overall objective was to be measured by applying the indicator 'volume of domestic and international traffic' and achievement of the project purpose based on the amount of the reduction in vehicle operating costs.

Major Deviations from the original Project Planning and their main Causes

The original financial contribution was increased by DEM 3.0 million after the planned co-financing by the World Bank did not materialize. Additional, residual funds from other FC programmes in the amount of some DEM 1.0 million were added to this sum.

Owing to the political difficulties in the region and the civil war, which began in 1990, it was extremely difficult to carry out the tendering procedure, and the commencement of the work was postponed. Overall this set the construction work back by roughly 3.5 years. However, as the award of the contract was moderately priced and the national currency was devaluated, the total costs did not rise. An expansion in the scope of services that became necessary also remained within the planned budget.

Major Deviations in the Impact Analysis from the Project Appraisal Estimate and their main Causes

After falling owing to the war, nation-wide the volume of traffic (as was the case with the population) more or less reached its 1991 level. This also applies to the corridor Rusumo-Kayonza-Kigali-Ruhengeri-Gisenyi/Cyanika, which could be kept in an easily passable condition overall despite the military conflicts. Due to this unforeseen development, only the status quo ante could be reestablished. The availability of a foreign trade corridor as an alternative to a (more significant) northern corridor is suited to ensure that Rwanda's foreign trade will remain uninterrupted in the long term. Additionally, effects on the development of the southeastern region can be noted.

As a result of the zero growth in the volume of traffic, the vehicle operating costs also remained unchanged by the project compared with their level at the time of the project appraisal. However, since the roads could be maintained in the desired condition in spite of the war damages, at least an increase in the vehicle operating costs could be avoided. Apart from the military conflicts, another reason for the low degree of achievement of the objectives is the fact that heavy-load vehicle traffic on the project road did not develop as projected but rather shifted accordingly once the northern corridor was reopened.

Since the traffic flows more smoothly than before, the effects of road use on the environment can be expected to be positive (environmental category UR0). The sector 'participatory development and good governance' is not relevant in this project context (category PD/GG0). The project has no specific gender effects (category G0) and there are not any substantial impacts on the poverty situation (category: general developmental orientation).

Summarized Justification of the Performance Rating

Despite the consequences of war, in the past years the traffic on the transit road from Rusumo-Kayonza-Kigali-Ruhengeri-Gisenyi/Cyanika was able to be assured and missing sections in the road were filled in. The volume of traffic did not develop as originally expected due to the impacts of the war. At the moment it is on about the same level as at the beginning of the project. The maintenance of the road condition on an appropriate level and the good passability of the roads are ensured by past and present maintenance measures so that the project purpose can be considered as having been achieved. With regard to the maintenance of the asphalt roads, although there is still a sustainability risk it will decline in the future as a result of the installation of a new, independent road maintenance fund (Fonds d'Entretien Routier) as far as ongoing maintenance is concerned. In our opinion, the chances that this risk will decline are good. Even if there is still room for improvement on the earnings side, the revenues are not

expected to double in the next few years, which is necessary in order to finance periodic maintenance. The demands on the infrastructure (resolution of damages, resettlement of refugees) and on other sectors (health care, family planning, AIDS prevention etc.), which rose again after the war, are overtaxing this country poor in resources. It is, however, guaranteed that this gap will be filled in the future as well via external financing. In general the project – when the aspect of sustainability is also taken into account – is judged to have achieved its objectives to an adequate degree (partial evaluation **effectiveness**: rating 3).

Thanks to the relatively good performance of the work, the condition of the road was able to be assured without requiring much ongoing maintenance, and the Akagera bridge near Rusumo required comparatively little maintenance due to its robust construction. The existence and function of the key alternative foreign trade route to Tanzania are ensured, as is the connection of the southeastern region and the provincial capital of Kibungo (overall objective). Owing to the significance of having an alternative corridor to the northern corridor (easy to access and thus preferred) in order to ensure uninterrupted foreign trade for the country's development, the project is judged to have a satisfactory degree of significance/relevance (partial evaluation: **significance/relevance**: rating 2).

According to our calculations based on conservative estimates, the project achieved a positive macroeconomic rate of return of 11%, which is even higher when the social effects are taken into consideration. As a result of the military conflicts, ultimately only the status quo ante could be reestablished so that deductions in the project's efficiency are justifiable. Furthermore, the weighing station supplied and installed for the border station is no longer functioning, so that altogether the project can be rated as satisfactory (partial evaluation **efficiency**: rating 2).

After weighing the above mentioned key criteria for the development-policy evaluation of project success, we classify the project overall as having a **satisfactory degree of effectiveness (rating 2)**.

General Conclusions applicable to all Projects

For decades German DC has been supporting Rwanda's road sector, resulting in a functioning transport system which satisfies one of the prerequisites for the country's economic development and enables this development to continue. Despite the scarcity of resources and the problems tied to population policy, for years Rwanda has had the reputation of being one of the most developed countries in Africa south of the Sahara. DC's contribution to improving the living conditions of the population was considerable and was only upset by the military problems in the 1990s. However, one lesson learned is that the DC commitment and the parallel commitment of several donors in the sector encouraged a certain "taker mentality" on the part of our partners, which jeopardized the aspired know-how transfer, among other things. A systematic coordination of the promotional approaches and policies of the various donors is thus particularly important. Consequently, an attempt should be made to include the private sector more intensively in operation and maintenance.