

**Guatemala: Teacher-Training Centers of the Salesians**

**Ex-post evaluation**

<b>OECD sector</b>	Basic education / 11220	
<b>BMZ project ID</b>	1995 66 621	
<b>Project-executing agency</b>	Asociación Salesiana de Don Bosco (ASCB)	
<b>Consultant</b>	GITEC/CORDON y MERIDA	
<b>Year of ex-post evaluation</b>	<b>2004</b>	
	<b>Project appraisal (planned)</b>	<b>Ex-post evaluation (actual)</b>
<b>Start of implementation</b>	Q 4 1997	Q 1 1998
<b>Period of implementation</b>	3 years	4 years
<b>Investment costs</b>	EUR 4.7 million	EUR 5.5 million
<b>Counterpart contribution</b>	EUR 0.61 million	EUR 1.41 million
<b>Financing, of which Financial Cooperation (FC) funds</b>	EUR 4.09 million	EUR 4.09 million
<b>Other institutions/donors involved</b>	-	EU project PROASE
<b>Performance rating</b>	3	
<b>Significance / relevance</b>	3	
<b>Effectiveness</b>	3	
<b>Efficiency</b>	4	

**Brief Description, Overall Objective and Project Objectives with Indicators**

The project consisted in the construction and equipment of a teacher-training center for girls' schools, the extension and complementary equipment of two existing teacher-training centers of the Salesians (one for girls and one for boys) and the construction and equipment of seven pilot schools. To a lesser extent, it also comprised consultancy services on the improvement of the teacher-training.

The project "Teacher-training centres of the Salesians" aims at improving and extending the bilingual primary school teacher-training and community work in the department of Alta Verapaz (project objective). The project is to be measured by the following indicators:

- (a) In the Salesian centres, promoted under German Financial Cooperation (FC), at least 440 bilingual primary school teachers were trained.
- (b) Once they have finished their studies, at least 70% of the teachers trained in the centres work in the schools parented by the Salesians or in other schools in the region.
- (c) The educational centers cover approximately 500 schools and 250 communities. Approximately 36,000 students and 5,000 adults benefit from the measure every year (e.g. literacy courses).
- (d) The bilingual material elaborated under the project is used during the classes and is available in at least 50% of the Salesian schools.

The project is to contribute to improving the primary school education in the project region with a high percentage of indigenous population (k'ekchi') (overall objective). The overall objective is to be considered attained, if three years after the completion of the project (2003) the gross and net school enrolment rates in the project region have increased from 57 to 65% and from 43 to 50%, respectively.

### **Project Design / Major Deviations from the original Project Planning and their main Causes**

During the phase of implementation the construction measures concentrated on three instead of four originally planned institutions: Talita Kumi Carchá and Carolina for girls, Don Bosco Tzacanihá for boys. The measures planned for the Raxhará site were not implemented. The reason for this was the concentration of teacher training on the centrally located Tzacanihá, and with hindsight and given the utilisation problems in Carolina, this decision proved to be right. The funds not used for Tzacanihá were taken to build two more three-class pilot schools. Four of the altogether seven pilot schools were handed over as primary or pre-schools to the Ministry of Education or the respective village development council. The remaining three institutions are being supervised by local Salesian sisters, who were trained in Talita Kumi. They are primary and lower secondary schools with an affiliated boarding school for girls.

Another change regarded the technical advice for the intercultural bilingual orientation of teacher training (IZE), which was not as planned put out to tender or provided by the University of Landívar, but was provided in a cost-saving way under the EU project PROASE domiciled in Alta Verapaz.

The project implementation took four years, which was one year longer than scheduled.

### **Key Results of the Impact Analysis and Performance Rating**

Due to the strong dedication of young teachers to the development of primary education in rural and remote regions, which as a particular focus of the project, it had a positive impact on the school education provided to marginalised village communities. About 80% of the teachers to be assigned to PRONADE schools<sup>1</sup>, which look after these regions, were trained at the Salesian centers. Thus, the Salesian centers in the department of Alta Verapaz gave an important impetus to the expansion and improvement of primary education and contributed to laying the basis for the development and participation of the poor indigenous population.

The boarding school of the Don Bosco Center now has the capacity for training over 100 teacher students every year. In addition, auxiliary teachers were trained in correspondence courses.

Talita Kumi provided a differentiated offer for girls and young women at its two sites, and in particular at Carchá, comprising primary schools, lower secondary schools, training of female teachers and training to become a rural advisor and in addition also qualification programmes. Approximately 20 female primary school teachers graduated every year.

The maintenance of the three pilot schools directly supervised by Talita Kumi (primary and lower secondary school) was financed by the Salesians. In reaction to the bottlenecks that existed at the near-by public primary schools Talita Kumi handed over four schools to the MINEDUC and local village development councils. Problems continue to exist at the school in Campur, whose level of utilisation is too low. A new utilisation concept is currently under

---

<sup>1</sup> PRONADE is a country-wide primary education programme for the promotion of rural and mainly indigenous regions (compare the evaluation report on the FC Programme PRONADE I (BMZ Project ID 1997 65 959) dated December 14, 2004).

discussion. The schools that are operated by Talita Kumi are pursuing new concepts of multi-class teaching and self-learning at primary schools and a learning system with tutor at lower secondary schools. They are being monitored by local sisters ("hermanas"). The fees paid by the pupils and students and grants from the Ministry cover part of the financing of the measures.

The consistent orientation of teacher training at the Salesian centers towards marginalised rural areas and the appreciation and didactic use of the indigenous language and culture (k'ekchi') are a major precondition for the active participation of this population group in the Guatemalan population and the improvement of its socio-economic situation. Especially in Talita Kumi a new picture of the k'ekchi' woman and her potentials is created. The pedagogic innovations developed in particular at Talita Kumo are expected to produce further impacts in the future, especially so if they are taken up and implemented on a broad scale in the context of an educational reform.

The teacher training at secondary schools in Alta Verapaz was further strongly developed: Teacher training is offered at another 41 secondary schools, of which 34 are oriented towards intercultural bilingual education (IZE) and 14 offer correspondence courses. In 2004 almost 5,000 teacher candidates were trained as primary and pre-school teachers, of which 1,900 were women. The training is provided on the basis of specified guidelines and is supervised by the school authorities. In terms of quality, however, the new institutions still have deficits. One also has to take into consideration that most graduates from the above-mentioned training institutions are not interested in taking up a teacher's job in a remote village (hardly any additional income, low quality of life), but opt for other jobs or embark on a new course of studies.

Based on the indicators formulated, the project objectives were achieved or over-achieved:

- (a) By 2003 1,677 teachers had been trained at Don Bosco and 89 at Talita Kumi. 1,074 of the teachers who graduated from Don Bosco (120 of which are women) had taken correspondence courses, which had not been intended upon project appraisal. The total number of graduates who participated in courses at the training centers (Don Bosco and Talita Kumi) was 692. This clearly exceeds the number of 440 graduates originally planned. Moreover, the infrastructure is used for primary and secondary school teaching.
- b) Around 97% (as compared with the planned figure of 70%) of graduates work at schools located in the department and the majority of graduates even work at PRONADE schools.
- (c) The training centers covered far more than the number of villages and schools originally planned. Most of the 827 rural primary schools set up by Don Bosco were handed over to PRONADE and are not being monitored by PRONADE. Since 1994 altogether approximately 66,000 pupils were educated in these schools by teachers trained for the most part in Don Bosco. Talita Kumo provides broadly based training courses (apart from teacher training also agricultural extension, health and community development, covering over 2,700 students) for more than 1,000 communities.
- (d) The Salesian centers do very rarely work out and develop teaching materials themselves but rather rely on material provided under other projects or by the Ministry of Education. Only Talita Kumo has started to develop material for teacher training on the basis of advice provided by PROASE. However, at the time of the final project evaluation such material had not been finalised.

Due to the correspondence courses for auxiliary teachers it was possible to train far more teachers than had been planned. Thus, the total need existing in the region was covered at an earlier stage than had been scheduled. As a consequence of this development the training capacities established at Don Bosco will in the future not be used for teacher training but possibly for crafts training of young men from the k'ekchi' communities. In future the usual need

for replacement of primary school teachers will be covered by the Talita Kumi Center and the private training institutions that have been set up in the meantime.

Based on the indicators formulated, the overall objective was over-achieved: Three years after the completion of the project (2003) the gross and net school enrolment rates in the project region were increased from 57 to 88% (planned: 65%) and from 43 to 63.8% (planned: 50%), respectively.

The developmental effectiveness of the project is assessed as follows:

- The project's effectiveness, i.e. the degree of achievement of the project objectives, is sufficient (rating 3). Some of the target indicators were clearly exceeded, while others, for instance regarding qualification and advice in the field of IZE, were not fully achieved. The satisfactory results with regard to teacher training numbers are only due to a limited extent to the infrastructure financed from FC funds and to a larger extent to the introduction of correspondence courses. The sustainable pursuit of the project objective, i.e. teacher training, will no longer be carried out in Don Bosco after June 2005. Still, the change in the use of the center is consistent given the current situation and will certainly benefit the target group in Alta Verapaz. The facilities in Talita Kumo will respond flexibly to the training needs.
- The efficiency of the project is rated as slightly insufficient (rating 4). The infrastructure at Don Bosco was set up in a cost-saving manner and has been used intensively over 4 to 5 years. However, the facilities will no longer be needed for teacher training in the future. In this respect the volume of the FC investments was oversized. Yet, the building will serve other developmentally sound purposes in the future.
- The project's developmental relevance is given. This statement is also true given the new private training capacities which would, however, not have been sufficient to adequately cover the need for teacher training in rural areas, neither qualitatively not quantitatively. But their offer is sufficient together with the training capacities in Talita Kumi to cover the future need for new teachers. The achievement of the overall objective can be rated as high since the project-executing agency gave a noticeable and clear impetus for the development of the education sector and the social recognition of the k'ekchi' population in the region. Here, too, the project only makes a limited contribution to the achievement of the project impacts. Thus we judge the significance and relevance of the project to be sufficient (rating 3).

In summary, we judge the developmental effectiveness of the project "Teacher training centers of the Salesians" to be satisfactory (rating 3).

#### Legend

Developmentally successful: Ratings 1 to 3	
Rating 1	Very high or high degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 2	Satisfactory developmental effectiveness
Rating 3	Overall sufficient degree of developmental effectiveness
Developmental failures: Ratings 4 to 6	
Rating 4	Overall slightly insufficient degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 5	Clearly insufficient degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 6	The project is a total failure

#### Criteria for the Evaluation of Project Success

The evaluation of the "developmental effectiveness" of a project and its classification during the ex-post evaluation into one of the various levels of success described in more detail below concentrate on the following fundamental questions:

- Are the **project objectives** reached to a sufficient degree (aspect of project **effectiveness**)?
- Does the project generate sufficient **significant developmental effects** (project **relevance** and **significance** measured by the achievement of the overall development-policy objective defined beforehand and its effects in political, institutional, socio-economic and socio-cultural as well as ecological terms)?
- Are the **funds/expenses** that were and are being employed/incurred to reach the objectives **appropriate** and how can the project's microeconomic and macroeconomic impact be measured (aspect of **efficiency** of the project conception)?
- To the extent that undesired **(side) effects** occur, are these tolerable?

We do not treat **sustainability**, a key aspect to consider for project evaluation, as a separate category of evaluation but instead as a cross-cutting element of all four fundamental questions on project success. A project is sustainable if the project-executing agency and/or the target group are able to continue to use the project facilities that have been built for a period of time that is, overall, adequate in economic terms, or to carry on with the project activities on their own and generate positive results after the financial, organisational and/or technical support has come to an end.