

**Côte d'Ivoire: Methodist Church Primary and Secondary Schools**

**Ex post evaluation report**

<b>OECD sector</b>	11320 / secondary education	
<b>BMZ project ID</b>	1994 65 137	
<b>Project-executing agency</b>	Direction Générale des Ecoles Protestantes Méthodistes (DGEM)	
<b>Consultant</b>	CES, Salzgitter	
<b>Year of ex post evaluation</b>	<b>2006</b>	
	<b>Programme appraisal (planned)</b>	<b>Ex post evaluation (actual)</b>
<b>Start of implementation</b>	Q2 1995	Q3 1995
<b>Period of implementation</b>	48 months	61 months
<b>Investment costs</b>	EUR 4.20 million	EUR 4.41 million
<b>Counterpart contribution</b>	EUR 0.37 million	EUR 0.47 million
<b>Financing, of which Financial Cooperation (FC) funds</b>	EUR 3.83 million	EUR 3.94 million
<b>Other institutions/donors involved</b>	-	-
<b>Performance rating:</b>	3	
• <b>Significance / relevance</b>	2	
• <b>Effectiveness</b>	2	
• <b>Efficiency</b>	4	

\* Including prefinancing from FC project for primary and secondary schools in Basassandra (1998 66 252)

**Brief description, overall objective and programme objectives with indicators**

In an open programme, the construction, fitting and rehabilitation of church-run primary and secondary schools is intended to give approximately 3,700 children access to higher quality schooling. This project provides financing for the construction and equipping of three secondary schools in large urban areas and two primary schools in small towns as well as for comprehensive rehabilitation of 13 rural primary schools. The project executing agency is the Methodist Church in Côte d'Ivoire.

The overall project objective is to contribute to improving primary and secondary school education in each area in which the schools are located. During the project appraisal, no indicator was defined; instead, the graduation rates for the individual educational levels are to be compared with the state sector.

The programme objectives are (a) to make it easier to access schooling at the planned new schools and (b) to improve learning conditions at the primary schools scheduled for rehabilitation. The following indicators were defined:

(a) The creation of 3,700 school places two years from the start of operation.

(b) A reduction of 5-10% in the drop-out and repeat rates two years from the start of operation.

### **Programme design / major deviations from the original programme planning and their main causes**

The work was planned as an open programme; as local demand increased, the individual schools needed to make substantial adjustments (comparison of target and actual achievement), as indicated below.

<u>Programme appraisal (planned)</u>	<u>Ex post evaluation (actual)</u>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Construction and equipping of five primary schools in urban areas (total of 36 classrooms, administrative rooms)</li><li>• Construction and equipping of three secondary schools in Abidjan with a total of 40 classrooms, 13 special rooms and essential ancillary rooms, administrative rooms and dormitories</li><li>• Renovation and equipping of approximately 20 rural primary schools</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Construction and equipping of two urban primary schools with six classrooms each (Grand-Lahou, San Pedro); 8% of the total costs</li><li>• Construction and equipping of three secondary schools in Abidjan with a current total of 52 classrooms, special rooms, ancillary and administrative rooms (Plateau, Yopougon, Niangon); 77% of the total costs</li><li>• Rehabilitation of 13 rural primary schools, including, for two schools, complete renovation or partial new building and equipping with furniture; 15% of the total costs</li></ul>

The programme measures led to the creation of, at present, 671 primary school places and 2,441 secondary school places. The originally planned figure of 3,700 new school places (including 1,800 in primary schools and 1,900 in secondary schools) was not achieved, as the higher costs (see below) meant that the total number of schools had to be reduced. This had a negative effect on the primary schools, whereas the number of secondary schools remained as planned. Owing to the far higher need for rehabilitation that became apparent later on, improvements could be made at fewer rural primary schools than planned.

DGEM needed more consultant support for the implementation of the construction measures than planned. Further implementation aspects (manufacture of school furniture, equipping the science rooms) encountered no problems and the schedule (61 months – a delay of 9 months) was roughly observed.

At EUR 21,500, the cost of a new primary school class is well above comparable international data and the cost estimate made during the project appraisal (EUR 15,850). The cost of EUR 48,500 per secondary school class is high (project appraisal: EUR 41,900). However, the fittings and design of these schools is far better than elsewhere.

The open approach to planning the project proved its worth as fairly extensive adjustments were needed. Overall, the concept and its implementation were appropriate despite the cost development.

### **Key results of the impact analysis and performance rating**

The Methodist primary and secondary schools and a small number of day nurseries are run by the Direction Générale des Ecoles Protestantes Methodistes (DGEM).

Enrolment figures at the three new secondary schools financed from FC funds in the urban districts of Plateau, Yopougon and Niangon have been good in recent school years.

	2002/03	2004/05	2005/06
Number of pupils	3,187	2,685	2,448
Classrooms	62	57*	54*
Pupils/classroom	51.0	47.1	45.3

\*Some classrooms were converted into specialist rooms, e.g. for IT.

The very high number of pupils in 2002/03 reflects the fact that a number of pupils had fled the internal unrest in Sudan and were provisionally accommodated in Abidjan. Since then the classes have been reduced to an educationally better size again and classrooms have been converted into specialist rooms. This means that the Methodist schools have various additional rooms, e.g. for computer work, drama and language lessons. The well-equipped rooms are in intensive use in the mornings and afternoons. The annual figure for teaching hours (700-900 hours) is satisfactory and higher than in the state schools. Overall, the teaching conditions can be said to be very good.<sup>1</sup>

The Methodist schools are financed partly through school fees paid by the parents and partly by state subsidies (which are paid to all recognised private school operators).

- The school fees charged by the DGEM are graduated. For rural primary schools the annual fees per pupil are the equivalent of between EUR 10 and EUR 40, for urban primary schools between EUR 75 and EUR 180 and for secondary schools between EUR 300 and EUR 400. In EUR they are therefore just under twice as much as at the project appraisal.
- The annual subsidies agreed with the state amount to approximately EUR 60 per pupil for rural primary schools (provided the school fees are less than EUR 45) and EUR 37.5 for urban primary schools (provided the school fees are less than EUR 75). The state sends a certain number of pupils to private secondary schools (at the DGEM approximately 25% of the pupils) and pays an annual sum of approximately EUR 180 per pupil for the lower secondary school cycle and EUR 210 for the upper cycle.

The school fees cover 70% of the DGEM's operating costs; the state subsidies are intended to cover the remaining 30%. What has proved to be problematic is that the payments by the state are repeatedly transferred 6 to 12 months late, which has a negative impact on the DGEM's liquidity. The DGEM has already been obliged to reduce the teachers' salaries temporarily. After the MEN failed to meet the payment deadlines (March and May 2006) for the subsidies (approximately kEUR 800) for the 2005/06 school year, the primary school teachers had to make do temporarily with 50% of their salaries and the secondary school teachers with 70%.

The parent representatives interviewed are fully in support of the educationally demanding school concept and send their children there, irrespective of their children's religion, because of the good education and the high graduate rates. Because of the relatively high school fees, particularly in the secondary schools (EUR 300-400 per annum), there is, however, only a small proportion of children from poor families.

The two primary schools constructed as part of the programme (in San Pedro and Grand Lahou) on the south-west coast are exceptionally well utilised – with 337 and 334 pupils in the 2005/06 school year and 56 pupils to a classroom. The school fees of just under EUR 20 per annum are at the lower end of the scale. According to the DGEM, the schools are in a good

---

<sup>1</sup> In order to make a comparison, during the ex post evaluation on site a visit was made to a public sector school in Abidjan. The school was considerably larger – 7,000 pupils – and suffered mainly from lack of space. Class sizes of between 60 and 90 pupils meant that the general conditions were far worse than at the Methodist schools. The classrooms were also in a worse condition.

state of repair and are well maintained; this was confirmed explicitly by an unscheduled visit to San Pedro by a KfW delegation in May 2006.

The 13 rehabilitated primary schools are all in rural areas in the southern or south-western part of the country. They were attended by approximately 3,260 pupils in the 2005/06 school year. There are 82 classrooms with approximately 40 pupils per classroom – somewhat below the overall average (41.2). Because attendance at the state schools is free of charge, the DGEM has to keep school fees low, which makes it difficult to cover costs. The construction of living accommodation for teachers and canteens, which are financed by the German Church Development Service (EED, formerly EZE), is making these rural primary schools more attractive. The rehabilitated schools – for example, the roofs had been improved and raised – which were visited are in an acceptable condition.

All schools have a satisfactory supply of teaching and educational materials. The high motivation of the teachers, parents and pupils at the Methodist schools contributes to a high demand for places at the secondary schools, while the rural primary schools could do with up to 20% more utilisation with a corresponding increase in income.

Overall, the Methodist schools are run very successfully from an educational point of view. There are so far no maintenance deficiencies worth mentioning. The cross-subsidisation from the secondary to the rural primary schools targeted during the project appraisal is in operation but only covers the overall operating costs. The liquidity shortages that have occurred have not yet led to a reduction in the quality of the teaching. Assuming that the political and economic situation does not worsen perceptibly, the sustainability of professional school operation in the schools financed is distinctly probable.

The project objectives were achieved as described below:

- (a) The creation of 3,700 school places two years after the start of operation (i.e. 2002/03): The aforementioned figure referred to the planned composition of the schools during the project appraisal. If the three secondary and two primary schools actually built with a planned class size of 46 and 50 respectively is taken as the basis, the actual figure for the 2005/06 school year with 671 primary and 2,441 secondary school pupils is 3.7% above the targeted pupil figure (primary schools: 600, secondary schools: 2,400) (in 2002/03 the figure was even higher because of the refugees from the north). The lower number of schools or school places than in the project appraisal is connected with the increase in the cost of the classrooms. Further to the project appraisal, the share of girls is also now normally indicated. Girls account for 51% of the pupils at the DGEM's secondary schools; this is 18% more than at the state secondary schools and 11% more than at the other private secondary schools.
- (b) A reduction of 5-10% in the drop-out and repeat rates two years from the start of operation (i.e. 2002/03): The repeat rate improved from approximately 28% (at the project appraisal in 1994/95) to 24.6% (at the final review in 1998/99) and then to 13.5% (in 2004/05). The drop-out rate is estimated at 2-4% (no precise statistics are available). This rate is slightly above the figure at the time of the project appraisal (1.7%) but is far better than at the state schools.

Overall, the programme objectives have thus been largely achieved.

The graduation rates compared with those in the state sector should be taken as the indicator of achievement of the overall objective. With regard to primary school graduation after six years with transfer to the lower secondary school level, the success rates at the DGEM primary schools are roughly 10% higher than at the state schools. The achievement of the pupils from the Methodist schools at the end of the first secondary school level and after the final school-leaving examinations (baccalauréat) is well above average. The overall objective was therefore also achieved.

Of the pupils in secondary school education, 42% attend private schools. The Methodist schools with their lower repeat and drop-out rates also ease the burden on the state system. In rural areas, however, the DGEM has had to close primary schools in recent years because of insufficient demand and hand them over to the state.

The teaching and learning conditions in the DGEM's primary and secondary schools have clear advantages over public sector schools. The educational provision at these private schools thus sends a positive signal. However, educational or other models have not yet been transferred to the state system. Overall, the project – as expected in the project appraisal report – contributed to a relevant improvements in the educational provision, particularly at the secondary school level; however, the improvements generally affected certain areas only. The graduates of the Methodist primary and secondary schools are in a good position to attend further or higher education institutions or to start vocational training. There are, however, no studies of what happened to school-leavers after they left school.

Given the low enrolment rate for girls at the project appraisal, there was room for improving the percentage of girls attending school. This has been achieved at both primary and secondary schools, whereas there has recently even been a decline in the numbers of girls attending state-run secondary schools. Of the roughly 25% of secondary school pupils for whom the state provides grants to enable them to attend DGEM-run schools, a significant proportion are expected to come from poorer families. School fees are waived primarily for children of DGEM employees or members of the Methodist Church and otherwise to a very limited extent for orphans. Overall, the share of pupils from poor families attending the Methodist schools is therefore below average.

With regard to environmental protection and resource conservation, a limited amount of laboratory waste should be mentioned; it is disposed of in an appropriate manner.

The key current risk in the project has to do with the continued uncertain political and economic situation in the country, which, among other things, is having an extremely negative impact on the DGEM's liquidity. Although this has not yet had any impact on the achievement of the project objectives, a worsening of the general situation could have a negative effect on the long-term operation of the schools.

To sum up, we assess the developmental impact of the programme on the basis of the criteria of efficiency, effectiveness and relevance/significance as follows.

- Efficiency: The production efficiency of the programme (cost per classroom) is evaluated as slightly insufficient. Despite high school fees, the DGEM cannot cover all its costs and has chronic problems with paying its permanent staff as the state subsidies are not provided promptly (allocation efficiency). A positive evaluation can be given of the internal efficiency, both in absolute terms and in comparison with the state school education system. Overall the project's efficiency is rated as slightly insufficient (sub-rating 4).
- Effectiveness: Overall, the programme objectives of increasing access to primary and secondary schools and of improving the learning conditions in the area of the primary schools scheduled for rehabilitation have largely been achieved. We therefore consider the effectiveness to be satisfactory (sub-rating 2).
- Relevance/significance The relevance of the programme is high as, judging by the pupils' performance, it provides an exemplary education system, which, however, has little opportunity of being carried over to the state system. The overall objective was achieved in full and the share of girls at the Methodist schools is exemplary. The low level of participation by children from poor families can be criticised. Overall, we rate the relevance and significance as satisfactory (sub-rating 2).

The developmental impact of the project “Methodist Church Primary and Secondary Schools” is evaluated as being altogether adequate (rating 3).

### General conclusions and recommendations

If the central aim of the programme is to improve the quality of education, private school operators are particularly appropriate. In designing the set-up, attention needs to be paid to ensuring that the conditions favour spillover effects to the state education sector as much as possible.

### Assessment criteria

Developmentally successful: Ratings 1 to 3	
Rating 1:	Very high or high degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 2:	Satisfactory degree of developmental efficacy
Rating 3:	Overall sufficient degree of developmental effectiveness
Developmental failures: Ratings 4 to 6	
Rating 4:	Overall sufficient degree of developmental effectiveness
Rating 5:	Clearly insufficient developmental effectiveness
Rating 6:	The project is a total failure.

### Performance evaluation criteria

The evaluation of the “developmental efficacy” of a project and its classification during the ex-post evaluation under one of the various levels of success described in more detail above concentrate on the following fundamental questions:

- Have the **project objectives** been achieved to a sufficient degree (project **effectiveness**)?
- Does the project generate sufficient **significant developmental effects** (project **relevance** and **significance** measured by the achievement of the overall development-policy objective defined beforehand and its effects in political, institutional, socio-economic and socio-cultural as well as ecological terms)? Are the **funds/expenses that were and are being employed/incurred appropriate** with a view to achieving the objectives and how can the programme’s microeconomic and macroeconomic impact be measured (**efficiency** of the programme design)?
- To the extent that undesired (**side**) **effects** occur, can these be tolerated?

We do not treat **sustainability**, a key aspect to consider when a project is evaluated, as a separate evaluation category, but rather as an element common to all four fundamental questions on project success. A project is sustainable if the project-executing agency and/or the target group are/is able to continue to use the project facilities that have been created for a period of time that is, overall, adequate in economic terms, or to carry on with the project activities independently and generate positive results after the financial, organisational and/or technical support has come to an end.