

Cameroon: Road Construction in the North-West Province

Ex-post evaluation

Project	a) Rural development in the North-West Province Expansion of the Bambui-Fundong road b) Rehabilitation of the Bamenda-Bambui road	
OECD sector	21020 / Road traffic	
BMZ project number	a) 1980 66 409 b) 1996 65 068	
Project-executing agency	Ministère des Travaux Publics	
Consultant	DIWI, Essen	
Year of evaluation	2002	
	Project appraisal (planned)	Ex-post evaluation (actual)
Start of implementation	a) Q IV/1981 b) Q IV/1996	a) Q IV/1992 b) Q IV/1996
Period of implementation	a) 24 months b) 15 months	a) 44 months b) 16 months
Investment costs	a) EUR 23.9 million b) EUR 5.13 million	a) EUR 29.3 million b) EUR 5.13 million
Counterpart contribution	a) EUR 4.8 million b) EUR 0.02 million	a) EUR 0.9 million b) EUR 0.02 million
Financing, of which Financial Cooperation funds	a) EUR 19.1 million b) EUR 5.11 million	a) EUR 28.4 million b) EUR 5.11 million
Other institutions/donors involved	no	no
Performance rating	3	
• Significance / relevance	3	
• Effectiveness	2	
• Efficiency	3	

Brief Description, Overall Objective and Project Purposes with Indicators

The objective of the two projects was to contribute to the economic development of the North-West Province of Cameroon and to the more efficient supply of the Cameroon population with goods and services. The traffic volume (vehicles/day) was determined as the indicator of the achievement of the overall objective. Project a) comprised the expansion of the Bambui-

Fundong road (57.6 km). The goal of this project was the cost-efficient servicing of road traffic between the towns of Bambui and Fundong and the year-round connection with the administrative centre of Bamenda and the Cameroon road network. The reduction in vehicle operating costs were determined as the indicator of achievement of the project purpose. Project b) comprised the rehabilitation and partly the expansion of the Bamenda-Bambui road (approx. 10 km), which is part of the so-called Ring Road in the Cameroon North-West Province and as such constitutes an important connection of this region with the administrative centre of Bamenda and offers access to the more distant markets in Bafoussam, Douala and Yaoundé.

Project Conception / Major Deviations from the original Project Planning and their main Causes

None.

Key Results of the Impact Analysis and Performance Rating

The Bambui – Fundong road gives the project region access to the central town of the region and to Cameroon's entire road network. The region and the agricultural sector in the catchment area of the road give the impression of activity. According to information provided by the local authorities there is no above-average migration away from the region. Agriculture seems to be very diversified and intensive and the surface where farming is possible due to the topography seems largely utilized.

During the project appraisal the Bamenda – Bambui road was identified as the bottleneck in the Ring Road which hampers a functioning economic and administrative life. The above-average results of the traffic development show that the rehabilitation of this section of the Ring Road has indeed made a substantial contribution to connecting and opening up the entire North-West Province.

In socio-economic terms the Bambui – Fundong road has a positive impact on the target group since people now have a safer, considerably faster and cheaper access to the central town of Bamenda and its services. Moreover, the prices of goods imported into the region have declined markedly. Due to the Bamenda – Bambui road large parts of the North-West Province may now benefit from the positive effects generated by the better access to the administrative, social and health facilities of the administrative centre of Bamenda. The poor in the region are also likely to profit from the effects of the project. From today's point of view the project also has a positive impact on women, though the impact is not extraordinary. Any major environmental damage caused by the two roads cannot be identified. The environmental damage caused is usual for normal roads and considered as acceptable.

With the reform of the transport system the road maintenance system and its financing was put on a fundamentally new and more efficient basis. The experience gained up to now with the new system is satisfactory. Thus, there is only little risk with regard to safeguarding the financing of the maintenance of the project road and to the sustainability of the project. The objectives of both projects have been met. Thus, the project's **effectiveness** is satisfactory (**partial evaluation: rating 2**).

The opening up of the catchment area, which was the intention of the Bambui – Fundong road, has been achieved. The road is used and offers the population clear advantages with regard to

transport times and costs as well as the exchange of goods with the region and the prices of goods imported to the region. Furthermore, the services offered in the central town can be better reached. The Bamenda – Bambui road eliminates a clear bottleneck on the Ring Road, which is important for the entire North-West Province. Thus, we classify the project's developmental **relevance and significance** as adequate (**partial evaluation: rating 3**).

The funds provided for the construction of the two roads were comparably high. Thus, the production efficiency is poor. The economic results of the project are acceptable to good. Since we regard the risk to an adequate and lasting maintenance to be low we consider the sustainability of the project impact as ensured and the allocation efficiency as given. Overall, we judge the **efficiency** of the project to be sufficient (**partial evaluation: rating 3**).

After weighing the above mentioned key criteria for the development-policy evaluation of project success, we classify the project **overall as having an adequate degree of developmental effectiveness (rating 3)**.

General Conclusions applicable to all Projects

The concept development and implementation of sector reforms in the context of a larger sector programme, in which several donors participate by providing finance for consultancy and investments, thus, jointly exercising a larger influence, has proven to be effective also in the Cameroon road sector.

Despite the positive effects of the sector reforms, the question of how to ensure the financing of the maintenance of the project in the long-term and on a sustained basis has still not been fully clarified. This shows that special attention has still to be paid to the appraisal and discussion of this aspect when implementing road construction projects.

Legend

Developmentally successful: Ratings 1 to 3

Rating 1 Very high or high degree of developmental effectiveness

Rating 2 Satisfactory degree of developmental effectiveness

Rating 3 Overall sufficient degree of developmental effectiveness

Developmental failures: Ratings 4 to 6

Rating 4 Overall slightly insufficient degree of developmental effectiveness

Rating 5 Clearly insufficient degree of developmental effectiveness

Rating 6 The project is a total failure

Criteria for the Evaluation of Project Success

The evaluation of a project's "developmental effectiveness" and its assignment during the final evaluation to one of the various levels of success described below in more detail concentrate on the following fundamental questions :

- Are the **project objectives** reached to a sufficient degree (aspect of project **effectiveness**)?
- Does the project generate **sufficient significant developmental effects** (project **relevance and significance** measured by the achievement of the overall development-policy objective defined beforehand and its effects in political, institutional, socio-economic and socio-cultural as well as ecological terms)?

- Are the **funds/expenses that were and are being employed/incurred** to reach the objectives appropriate and how can the project's microeconomic and macroeconomic impact be measured (aspect of **efficiency** of the project conception)?
- To the extent that undesired **(side) effects** occur, are these tolerable?

We do not treat **sustainability**, which is a key aspect to consider for project evaluation, as a separate category of evaluation but instead as a cross-cutting element of all four fundamental questions of project success. A project is sustainable if the project-executing agency and/or the target group are able to continue to use the project facilities that have been built for a period of time that is, overall, adequate in economic terms or to carry on with the project activities on their own and generate positive results after the financial, organizational and/or technical support has come to an end.